

**THE EDWARD J. COLLINS, JR.  
CENTER FOR PUBLIC MANAGEMENT**

**MCCORMACK GRADUATE SCHOOL  
OF POLICY AND GLOBAL STUDIES**

University of Massachusetts Boston

100 Morrissey Boulevard

Boston, MA 02125-3393

P: 617.287.4824

[www.collinscenter.umb.edu](http://www.collinscenter.umb.edu)

# **Compensation Study of Selected Non-Union Positions for the School Department of The City of Somerville, MA**

**EDWARD J. COLLINS, JR. CENTER FOR PUBLIC MANAGEMENT**

**September 2012**



## INTRODUCTION

The City of Somerville (City) contracted with the Collins Center for Public Management (Collins Center) to conduct a Compensation Study of 23 non-union School Department positions.

## SALARY SURVEY

A salary survey was conducted to determine the ranges within which other, similar cities and towns compensate their employees. The criteria considered in recommending comparable municipalities included geographical proximity to Somerville, similarity of population size, and similarity in terms of the overall engagement of the municipality. After discussion, the following nine municipalities were used as the comparables for the survey.

Arlington	Lowell	Newton
Brookline	Malden	Quincy
Cambridge	Melrose	Waltham

The municipalities of Arlington, Cambridge Melrose, Newton and Waltham responded to the survey. While it would be desirable to have additional survey data, the data received are from a variety of municipalities and are sufficient for comparison purposes. Data were collected for limited positions for Brookline and Malden using the results of a benchmark survey conducted by the Massachusetts Association of School Committees. The Collins Center is confident that any additional survey data received would not significantly change the survey averages.

The 23 positions surveyed were selected by the School Department to be benchmarks, or a representation of the non-union positions. In addition to requesting minimum, maximum, and actual salaries, respondents were asked to share information about the position that may be different than the Somerville title. Duties vary within the same title. For example, the Somerville title of Account Supervisor has the title of Budget Analyst in another school department and Somerville's Director of Operations is similar to Business Administrator in other school departments. The survey results are contained in Attachment A.

The survey results indicate that in general Somerville salaries are lower than those of the comparable school departments. Because many Somerville positions are unique to Somerville, some of the survey data should not be used as a direct comparison. For instance, the Lead Technology Specialist, Coordinator of Parent Information, Coordinator of Grant Writing & Information, Director of Finance, and Director of Operations positions are not directly comparable to the reported data. While the titles may be similar, the functions, scope, and scale of the positions are different.

If the salaries for the non-comparable positions are not considered, the average difference in salary between the Somerville salaries and the survey average salaries is 8%.

It is important to remember that each municipality is different, and the internal comparability within a municipality's culture is just as important as external comparability when considering classification.

#### **REVIEW OF SALARY INCREASES FOR OTHER GROUPS**

The Director of Operations shared a summary sheet of the salary increases granted to various school groups over the past years. (Attachment B) The following is a brief summary of the increases as described in Attachment B.

	<b>FY09 7/1/2008</b>	<b>FY10 7/1/2009</b>	<b>FY11 7/1/2010</b>	<b>FY12 7/1/2011</b>	<b>FY13 7/1/2012</b>	<b>Total Increase FY09-11</b>
<b>Nonunion *</b>	3%	0	0	0		3.0%
<b>SAA</b>	3%	0	0	0		3.0%
<b>STA Paraprofessionals</b>	3%	3%	1.5%	2.5%	2%	7.5%
<b>Community Schools, UAW</b>	3%	3%	3%			9.0%
<b>SCALE PA's, UAW</b>	3%	3%	3%			9.0%
<b>SCALE Employee's Union (STA, SEU)</b>	3%	3%	3%			9.0%
<b>Somerville Teachers Association (STA)</b>	3%	3%	3%	2.5%		9.0%
<b>AFSCME, Clerical</b>	3%	0	3%	3%		6.0%
<b>AFSCME, Cafeteria</b>	3%	0	3%	3%		6.0%

The last salary increase granted to non-union employees was July 1, 2008. The above chart compares the increases granted over a 5-year period of time. All union groups settled contracts through fiscal year 2010. The average increase granted was 7.3% over the 3 year period for FY2009 – FY2011.

Additionally, non-union employees were subjected to furloughs in two consecutive fiscal years. While the rate of pay was not decreased, annual income was reduced by almost 2% in each year. Other groups made concessions as well, but received increases and other wage enhancements such as modified pay scales. Only one group has received the same total increase as the non-union employees. However, that unionized group is currently in negotiations.

## **DISCUSSION & RECOMMENDATION**

When considering how to approach salary increases for non-union personnel, information from the survey and the internal history is taken into consideration. As noted above, the average difference in salary is 8% as compared to external comparables and is 7.3% for a similar period for internal comparables.

Since a comprehensive classification study was not done for all non-union personnel, it is recommended that an across the board salary increase be granted to provide for some “catch up” for non-union personnel, effective July 1, 2012.

Based on the survey data received and comparison to internal groups, the following increases are recommended for non-union personnel.

<b>IF EMPLOYED ON W/OUT BREAK IN SERVICE</b>	<b>INCREASE GRANTED EFFECTIVE JULY 1, 2012</b>
July 1, 2009	10%
July 1, 2010	8%
July 1, 2011	5%
July 1, 2012	2%

## **SPECIFIC POSITIONS**

In reviewing the survey results, internal comparables, and the organization of the School Department, it became clear that the Human Resources & Diversity Administrator position and a few technology positions require additional adjustment beyond the above mentioned recommendation. Further in-depth analysis of the duties performed by the incumbents should be conducted, and then those duties should be compared to duties performed in similar positions so that an equitable and appropriate adjustment can be made.

Additionally, with respect to the Principals, the issue of pay compression needs to be addressed. The union position of Assistant Principals has created a situation of subordinate pay catching up with, and in some cases, surpassing those of the managers. An adjustment to the Principal position may be necessary in light of the market survey and the internal organizational structure.

While the recommended adjustments may help in the short term, it will be important for the School Department to create a comprehensive pay and classification plan for its non union personnel, which should include uniform position descriptions in compliance with the American's with Disabilities Act as well as a system that creates equity internally and externally.

## **CONCLUSION**

The Collins Center would like to thank Joseph Tringale, Director of Operations, and Melissa DeResendes, Human Resources & Diversity Administrator, for all of their assistance.

**ATTACHMENT A  
SCHOOL DEPARTMENT SURVEY RESULTS**

	TITLE	Somerville	Arlington	Brookline*	Cambridge	Malden*	Melrose	Newton	Waltham	Average	Somerville-Average		
1	Account Supervisor	\$57,597	\$81,823										
2	Administrative Assistant to Assistant Superintendent Curriculum & Instruction	\$49,500	\$52,347		\$61,110		\$38,432	\$57,272	\$58,752	\$57,370	-\$7,870	-16%	
3	Administrative Assistant, Human Resources	\$45,000	\$52,347		\$61,110		\$45,000	\$56,881		\$53,835	-\$8,835	-20%	Duties vary with survey respondents
4	Assistant Food Services Director	\$57,000			\$72,886								
5	Assistant Manager of Pool Facilities	\$39,760											
6	Assistant Superintendent fo Schools, Curriculum & Instruction	\$121,540	\$127,000		\$165,561		\$110,000	\$139,250	\$128,750	\$134,112	-\$12,572	-10%	
7	Coordinator, Grant Writing & Information	\$65,000	\$81,389		\$94,150			\$106,814		\$94,118	-\$29,118	-45%	Duties vary with survey respondents
8	Coordinator, Parent Information Center	\$69,873			\$87,747		\$30,000		\$51,815	\$42,390	\$27,483	39%	Duties vary with survey respondents
9	Director of Finance	\$108,266	\$110,333	\$147,098	\$139,085		\$110,000	\$89,743	\$121,297	\$119,593	-\$11,327	-10%	
10	Director of Operations	\$98,346			\$159,659		\$73,000	\$125,852	\$115,054	\$118,391	-\$20,045	-20%	Duties vary with survey respondents
11	Director of Somerville Family & Community Connections	\$60,766											
12	Director, Food Services	\$86,900	\$76,500		\$76,108				\$92,798	\$81,802	\$5,098	6%	
13	Director, Special Education	\$108,150	\$128,000		\$136,330		\$104,000	\$135,930	\$126,000	\$126,052	-\$17,902	-17%	
14	District Administrator, ELE Programs & Community Partnerships	\$97,937	\$76,500										
15	Elementary School Principals	\$98,695	\$107,000	\$132,251	\$120,518	\$118,071	\$91,000	\$118,667		\$114,584	-\$15,889	-16%	
16	Executive Secretary to the Superintendent of Schools	\$63,750	\$55,483	\$77,758	\$60,836	\$79,110	\$55,200	\$82,652	\$72,284	\$69,046	-\$5,296	-8%	
17	Headmaster	\$115,000	\$118,267		\$144,099	\$115,542	\$123,000			\$125,227	-\$10,227	-9%	
18	Human Resources & Diversity Administrator	\$58,000	\$87,644		\$136,330			\$120,390	\$100,000	\$111,091	-\$53,091	-92%	Duties vary with survey respondents
19	Lead Technology Specialist	\$49,000	\$67,500		\$124,617		\$47,316	\$97,974		\$84,352	-\$35,352	-72%	Duties vary with survey respondents
20	Manager of Pool Facilities	\$58,610											
21	Network Administrator	\$61,800			\$71,552		\$60,117	\$92,344	\$65,069	\$72,271	-\$10,471	-17%	
22	Superintendent of Schools	\$178,820	\$167,260	\$207,000	\$242,000	\$160,000	\$160,000	\$239,030	\$157,080	\$190,339	-\$11,519	-6%	
23	Supervisor of Attendance 1	\$36,000	\$37,612						\$25,000	\$31,306	\$4,694	13%	
24	Supervisor of Attendance 2	\$65,372											
25	Systems & Database Administrator	\$82,400	\$75,000		\$96,863		\$57,000	\$87,648	\$60,194	\$75,341	\$7,059	9%	
26	Technology Specialist/Trainer	\$43,607	\$45,000		\$38,881		\$41,000			\$41,627	\$1,980	5%	
27	School Committee Chairman	\$10,507		zero	\$109,555	\$7,000		\$4,875					
28	School Committee Member	\$10,507		zero	\$36,193	\$7,000		\$4,875	\$10,256				
	* Survey data from Massachusetts Association of School Committees												

**ATTACHMENT B  
SCHOOL DEPARTMENT CONTRACT / WAGE / HEALTH INSURANCE SUMMARY**

<u>Employee Group</u>	<u>Date of Last Raise</u>	<u>Contract Expires</u>	<u>FY 2009 % Inc.</u>	<u>FY 2010 % Inc.</u>	<u>FY 2011 % Inc.</u>	<u>FY 2012 % Inc.</u>	<u>FY 2013 % Inc.</u>	<u>FY 2010 / FY 2011 Wage Concessions</u>	<u>Pre-GIC Insurance %</u>	<u>Health Insurance Comments</u>
<b>Nonunion</b>	7/1/2008	NA	3%	-1.92%	-1.92%	0%		FY '10 and FY '11: wages reduced / furloughed 1.92% in both years	25%	15% effective 7/1/2007; 20% effective 7/1/2008; 25% effective 7/1/2010
<b>SAA</b>	7/1/2012	6/30/2013	3%	0%	0%	0%		FY 2010: Agreed to wage freeze	15%	15% effective 5/1/2009
<b>STA Paraprofessionals</b>	9/1/2009	8/31/2013	3%	3%	1.50%	2.50%	2%	None	15%	15% effective 5/1/2009
<b>Community Schools, UAW</b>	7/1/2010	6/30/2011	3%	3%	3%			FY '10: Renegotiated wages - gave up 5.25 hours of wages	15%	15% effective 5/1/2009
<b>SCALE PA's, UAW</b>	7/1/2011	6/30/2014	3%	3%	3%			FY '10: Renegotiated wages: gave up 3 days of wages	15%	15% effective 5/1/2009
<b>SCALE Employee's Union (STA, SEU)</b>	9/1/2010	8/31/2011	3%	* 3%	* 3%			None	20%	20% effective 9/1/2010
<b>Somerville Teachers Association (STA)</b>	9/1/2010	8/31/2012	** 3% - 7%	** 3% - 6%	** 3% - 6%	2.50%		None	15%	15% effective 5/1/2009
<b>AFSCME, Clerical</b>	1/1/2011	6/30/2012	3%	0%	3%	*** 3%		FY '10: Renegotiated: 0% increase; no steps or longevity pay increases	15%	15% effective 5/1/2009
<b>AFSCME, Cafeteria</b>	9/1/2011	8/31/2012	3%	0%	3%	*** 3%		FY '10: Renegotiated: 0% increase; no steps or longevity pay increases	15%	15% effective 5/1/2009

\* Also added additional step for PT positions.

\*\* New salary schedule

\*\*\* Also added additional step

Note: All employees went to 15% GIC effective 1/1/2012.